



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

College Art Association of America

The Fifth Annual Meeting of the College Art Association of America was, in point of numbers, enthusiasm and the quality of the work done, a very successful meeting. Many of the papers there presented have been or are to be printed in full in various publications. Since the funds of the Association do not suffice for the printing of all the proceedings, it has been decided to print this Bulletin containing a resume of the discussions not elsewhere printed with statements as to where the remaining papers have been or are to be published.

PROGRAM FIFTH ANNUAL MEETING OF THE COLLEGE ART ASSOCIATION OF AMERICA

**IN HOUSTON HALL
UNIVERSITY OF PENNSYLVANIA**

Thursday, Friday and Saturday, April 20, 21 and 22, 1916.

THURSDAY, APRIL 20, 7 P. M.

Dinner at Hotel Normandie followed by "Round Table" discussion on: What Kinds of Art Courses are Suitable for the College A. B. Curriculum.

Opened by:

A. W. Dow, *Columbia*.

John Shapley, *Brown*.

FRIDAY, APRIL 21, 9 A. M.

In Houston Hall

Reports of Committees.

10 A. M.

Addresses of Welcome

EDGAR F. SMITH, *Provost of the University of Pennsylvania.*

JOHN F. LEWIS *President of Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts.*

President's Address: *The Doubting Thomas, A Bronze Group*
by *Andrea del Verrocchio:*

JOHN PICKARD, *Missouri*

Report of Committee on Investigation of Art Education in American
Colleges and Universities: MR. HOLMES SMITH, Chairman, *Washington*

Discussion opened by

C. F. KELLEY, *Ohio*

J. S. ANKENY, *Missouri*

MODERN TENDENCIES IN ART:

ARTHUR WESLEY DOW, *Columbia*

12:30 P. M.

Lunch at Hotel Normandie followed by "Round Table" discussion:

Report of Committee on Books for the College Art Library:

ARTHUR POPE, Chairman, *Harvard.*

Discussion opened by

C. R. MOREY, *Princeton*

MISS GEORGIANA G. KING, *Bryn Mawr*

2 P. M.

In Houston Hall

What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to:

1. The Future Artist?

Discussion opened by

FREDERICK DIELMAN, *College of the City of New York.*

MISS CECILIA BEAUX

MISS JEANNETTE SCOTT, *Syracuse*

A. V. CHURCHILL, *Smith*

ELLSWORTH WOODWARD, *Sophie Newcomb*

2. The Future Museum Worker?

Discussion opened by

JOSEPH BRECK, *Minneapolis Museum of Arts*
(Report of Committee on College Training for Museum Workers)

EDWARD ROBINSON, *Metropolitan Museum*

The Future Writer on Art?

Discussion opened by

MISS LEILA MECHLIN, *Secretary of the American Federation of Arts.*

DUNCAN PHILLIPS, of New York

7 P. M.

Dinner at Hotel Normandie followed by a "Round Table" discussion on, What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to the Future Layman?

Opened by

HOMER E. KEYES, *Dartmouth*
MISS EVA M. OAKES, *Oberlin*
MISS ELIZABETH H. DENIO, *Rochester*
H. H. POWERS, *President Bureau of University Travel*
GEORGE H. CHASE, *Harvard*

SATURDAY, APRIL 22, 9 A. M.

In Houston Hall

Problems in Art Education in Ohio

C. F. KELLEY, *Ohio*

The College Art Museum and Art Gallery:

1. A Working College Museum of Originals
FRANK J. MATHER, *Princeton*
2. The College Museum of Reproductions
WILLIAM N. BATES, *University of Pennsylvania*
D. M. ROBINSON, *Johns Hopkins*
3. Loan Exhibits in College Art Museums
W. A. GRIFFITH, *Kansas*
(Report of Committee on Loan Exhibits)
GEORGE B. ZUG, *Dartmouth*

Sienese Art as Represented in the Fogg Art Museum
G. H. EDGELL, *Harvard*

Reports:

Committee on Time and Place
Committee on Resolutions
Committee on Nominations

Election of Officers
Business

2:30 P. M.

Through the generous courtesy of the owner the Association was invited to visit the beautiful collections in Mr. Widener's country house, Lynnewood Hall at Ogontz.

THURSDAY, APRIL 20, 7 P. M.

Dinner at Hotel Normandie followed by "Round Table" discussion on: What Kinds of Art Courses are Suitable for the College

A. B. Curriculum.

Opened by:

A. W. Dow, *Columbia*

We shall all agree, I think, that the art course should awaken the students' critical sense, help him in his choices, encourage independence of judgment, and enlarge his appreciative powers. We differ as to the method of attaining this result.

Some would teach art by the lecture method exclusively. This seems to me a mistake, for ability to choose the fine is not something to be imparted like facts of science. I do not underrate historical knowledge, but I do think it is not enough. The professional man who regards Raphael as the greatest of all painters, Titian as immoral, Degas as degenerate and modernists as insane is not judging art works by their qualities but by their subjects. His training has been one-sided.

Shall we then admit "practical work" into the course for the A. B.? If by that you mean an art school routine, no, for that alone does not give even the art student the larger things of art. It does seem to me, however, that *some* kind of creative activity is necessary. The best way to appreciate the quality of a line is to take a piece of charcoal or a brush and try to draw one. The best way to recognize fine proportions in figure or building is to try to create good proportions. One can perceive some of the tone quality in Whistler's painting if he has mixed tones and tried to arrange them. As to color, surely all the theories and scientific knowledge will not do as much for us as actual attempts to produce simple color harmonies.

I cannot see why college faculties should be afraid of *experiments* in art. We could encourage students to experiment with line and color for the sake of appreciation, not for the sake of acquiring skill or of producing art works. This could be done without studio paraphernalia and without undue expenditure of time—even one hour per week would be worth while.

Educators are thundering against the lecture-method, the persistent telling, without encouraging students to express themselves. Art instruction should be self-expression from the very beginning, for art is the visible manifestation of the individual's ideas and appreciations.

The student who comes to college with some experience in art structure is better prepared to take up the history of Art than one who lacks such experience. In any case the simple exercises and experiments in producing harmonies of line, space, tone and color would mean a release of power, an opportunity for choice, an awakening of the critical sense and a growth in appreciation.

Discussion by JOHN SHAPLEY, *Brown*

Mr. Shapley spoke, in part, as follows:

The question of suitable art courses for the college A.B. curriculum, though usually considered solely from the standpoint of the instructor, deserves no less to be viewed from the position of the student. In fact, the student's needs and wishes may make the most significant contribution toward the successful solution of the problem.

As now constituted the A.B. course unites so-called cultural and so-called practical aims. Accordingly, the student demands two types of art courses, the general and the specific.

The former, the general, should be introductory in nature, so that all may be capable and desirous of entering. It should cultivate interest and knowledge in art matters as great as developed elsewhere on the college campus in the other forms of human activity, in science, in literature, in sport. It should be comprehensive, for many do not have opportunity for further art study. Yet it must be selective enough to throw emphasis on some important points with never-to-be-forgotten clearness.

While thus equipping every student for the countless decisions in matters of taste that he will be obliged to make in after life, this general course should also lead the way to the second type of art courses, the specific. The choice of these more circumscribed courses, however, must be left to be determined by local conditions.

FRIDAY, APRIL 21, 9 A. M.

In Houston Hall

Reports of Committees:

10 A. M.

Addresses of Welcome

EDGAR F. SMITH, *Provost of the University of Pennsylvania.*

JOHN F. LEWIS, *President of Pennsylvania Academy of Fine Arts.*

PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS

JOHN PICKARD, *Missouri*

The College Art Association of America has a great work to accomplish. We stand for the right of the American student in our higher institutions of learning to instruction in that subject which is at the same time most cultural to the minds of the learners and most practical in its effects on their lives. In thus standing for the right of the student we have to face in a considerable measure lack of appreciation on the part of the public, indifference in our faculties and governing boards and misunderstanding among the students. And at this the fifth annual meeting of our Association we are still at the beginning of the conflict.

The committee in charge of the preparations for this meeting sought and received much good advice concerning the program.

On the one hand were those who urged that our Association could not hope to take important rank and position among the learned societies of our time until our meetings are characterized by profound discussions of technical subjects—and not even then unless such learned papers are published as “original work” by our members. Original work! original work! what crimes, what atrocities are committed in thy name!

Other advisers have not hesitated to declare that such papers are usually tiresome and of little real worth. They insist that we should here compare syllabi of lecture courses, discuss whether or not text-

books shall be used in our classes and so endeavor to "standardize" our work.

Most counsellors are insistent that we publish our proceedings. Some, however, consider that our lucubrations are not very important and ask us to remember that the chief amusement connected with hash is found in the making and not in the eating of it.

Your committee is fully convinced of the great virtue—and greater rarity of originality, is heartily in favor of a wider knowledge of the excellent pedagogical methods used by some of our members, is unqualifiedly in favor of printing our proceedings.

But it has seemed to your committee that there are certain other fundamental questions to be considered. Educational processes in Art schools differ in no small degree, still we understand their purposes. Technical schools vary much in their use and abuse of Art yet we can usually find the logic of their requirements. But the College A. B. course, that last citadel of culture pure and undefiled—where and what is the position of Art in the college? This is a fundamental question for this College Art Association and to this question is a goodly portion of this meeting devoted.

It is possible that there may be among us today technical artists who hold that any study of Art without artists' tools in the students' hands is of no value, but I trust there is no one here who is so provincial. There may be within the sound of my voice someone who is convinced that no form of technical art has any place in our institutions of higher education but I hope that there is no one here who is so illiberal.

In our Association the Art School, the Technical School and the old College are all represented. We have among us the painter, the sculptor and the architect, the lecturer, the critic and the historian. Even the mere layman who has for Art a sneaking fondness which he cannot always explain is not lacking in our numbers.

And we who represent our higher institutions of learning look forth on the infinite field of Art through almost as many windows as there are pairs of eyes that do the looking. This very multiplicity of view points may be a cause of weakness or it can be a source of strength to this Association. A cause of weakness if any one group among us arrogates to itself the divine right of deciding what is and what is not of value in art education; a source of strength if all the classes here represented rise to such a height above the petty things of life as to realize that the field of art is as wide as is the range of life and that no one little coterie has the monopoly of wisdom in this field; that the artist, the critic and the layman, especially the layman, all have ideas and ideals in Art that should be respected, that are worth while. For without artists there could be no Art, without critics artists and laymen might fail to understand themselves and would certainly fail to understand each other, and without laymen there would be no artists.

So we will turn our weapons, not toward each other, but towards the common enemy, the commercial, the vicious and the ugly and adopt as our slogan: Art for higher education, and higher education for artists.

About 140 years ago on a certain hot July day a notable Assembly was held in a famous hall not so very far from where we are gathered today. It was there that rare Ben Franklin spoke those words of wisdom which we may well apply to ourselves. For he told his companions: "If we do not hang together we shall hang separately."

Mr. Pickard's paper on The Doubting Thomas, A Bronze Group by Andrea del Verrocchio, was printed in full in the *American Magazine of Art* for August, 1916.

Report of Committee on Investigation of Art Education in American Colleges and Universities: HOLMES SMITH, Chairman, Washington

This report was published in full in School and Society, August 26, 1916. Reprints have been sent to all members of the Association.

MODERN TENDENCIES IN ART:

ARTHUR WESLEY DOW, *Columbia*

This paper was published in full in the American Magazine of Art, January, 1917.

Lunch at Hotel Normandie followed by "Round Table" discussion:
Report of Committee on Books for the College Art Library:

ARTHUR POPE, Chairman, *Harvard*.

The Committee on Books for the College Art Library presents its report in the form of a card catalogue, a multigraphed summary of which is distributed to the members present. The summary, printed in order to indicate how far the work has at present progressed, gives only the author and brief title of each book, but the complete catalogue should, when finished, give for each work the author, the full title, and, just as far as possible, the publisher, date, size, number of volumes and price, together with some comment as to its general character and usefulness.

The aim of the committee is to make a catalogue which shall include standard books on the Fine Arts which every college or university ought, if possible, to offer for the use of its undergraduate students. This does not mean the inclusion of every book which a teacher might usefully employ in the instruction in a particular course. That, besides being a limitless task, would be of little use, for a teacher giving a course in a particular field, is naturally perfectly familiar with the books in that field. A catalogue of standard books may be of use rather in the case of an institution just beginning to form an art library where, as is so often the case, there are only one or two instructors, specialists in single fields, who must make the selection of books covering the whole subject of the Fine Arts.

At the present time only a beginning of such a catalogue has been made, as will be seen by the incomplete character of the summary distributed. Much labor by the new committee will be required to make anything like a complete catalogue by next year's meeting, and there must be constant revision by succeeding committees to keep it up to date. Antiquated books should be cut out, and important new ones added each year.

The chairman has still on hand a number of copies of the summary, which he will be glad to send to persons who apply to him. Address Prof. Arthur Pope, 11 Lowell street, Cambridge, Mass.

Respectfully submitted,

ARTHUR POPE, Chairman,

J. B. ROBINSON,

D. M. ROBINSON,

G. B. ZUG.

Discussion opened by C. R. MOREY, *Princeton*

Mr. Morey expresses his approbation, in general, of the bibliography as given. With a few changes here and there he believes that it would form an excellent buying list for any college art librarian. But he criticizes the list as having the "air of a collection of works on the Archaeology of Art," and as including too many popular handbooks which might be replaced by books that are really worth while. And he supplements this criticism with the suggestion of a number of books not included in the bibliography as reported that he believes should find a place in the college art library. His suggestions are mostly limited to mediaeval art, architecture, sculpture, illumination, and iconography. But he also suggests a few books in the Roman, Renaissance, and Modern fields.

Discussion by Miss G. G. KING, *Bryn Mawr*

Miss King's general criticism of the report of the committee is that there may, perhaps, figure in it too many handbooks and too many German authors. Handbooks are too general and tend to duplicate each other, Germans are messy-minded.

Books of mere comment and criticism should be for the use of the professor, not for the student, as they are likely to induce only prejudices in the mind of the student.

Such reproductions as the prints of the Bureau of University Travel attempt to cover too wide a field for the student's use. It is better for him to have detailed photographs of one building than general views of many.

Miss King urges the great need for students of books that will give a faithful and exact account of things. "Give them generalities and they will hand them back; but give them images and experiences and they will jump at the chance to put them together."

2 P. M.

In Houston Hall

What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to:

1. The Future Artist?

Discussion opened by

FREDERICK DIELMAN, *College of the City of New York.*

No resume of Mr. Dielman's paper has been received.

Discussion by MISS CECILIA BEAUX

Miss Beaux's paper was published in full in the *American Magazine of Art*, October, 1916.

Discussion by MISS JEANNETTE SCOTT, *Syracuse*

Technical training alone forms the subject of Miss Scott's discussion, although she recognizes that courses in the history of Fine Arts would naturally be included in the A. B. course. For this technical training she offers a tentative program, to be varied, of course, "according to the ability and progress of the student."

By compressing the required literary and science subjects into as few hours as possible there may be left ten to twelve hours a week for studio work. It is expected that in this time the college student will

make more progress than would be made in the same time by the student in the less obligatory atmosphere of the art school.

The course in college need not attempt to emphasize the particular branch of art to be chosen as a profession by the student, rather it should work toward the gaining of an insight into the general principles and ways of working.

For twelve hours a week, to count as five or six semester hours, Miss Scott suggests five hours of cast drawing, three hours of still life, two hours of composition, and two hours of sketch from the model. A clear distinction is always to be made between mere correct copying and true drawing; the latter involves creation. "The word drawing gains by being merged into that of construction, which emphasizes the dominant idea that should underlie all instruction in drawing." And this dominant idea is self-expression. Originality and imagination are stimulated by exercises in composition, which should be much emphasized in the student's art education from the very first.

Discussion by A. V. CHURCHILL, *Smith*

No abstract of Mr. Churchill's paper has been received.

Discussion by ELLSWORTH WOODWARD, *Sophie Newcomb*

Mr. Woodward said in part:

It is quite generally recognized that the preparation afforded the artist by the art school is in many respects inadequate. There is a lack of discipline resulting in irregularity of hours, lack of incentive to sustained effort in the absence of examinations, thus tending to make the art school in many ways ineffective, but above all there is danger in the fostering of the idea through specialization that the artist is a man apart from his fellows to whom is due special consideration. This is injurious to his standing as a citizen, a member of organized society.

It is a matter of common comment that the work of American artists on the whole indicates lack of scholarship. This is especially true in figure drawing and mural decoration, in which symbolism plays an important part. In the expanding belief in national power to take high rank in the world of the spirit, the young man of the day and immediate future looking towards the vocation of art, has and will have increasingly the desire to rank with the leaders of thought. The training of his intellectual powers in better harmony with his aesthetic and technical training, would react to the advantage of American art. It should be the care of the university to make this end more easily possible. Teachers of art in universities which offer special art instructions, meet the expressed desire of those who specialize in technical art for a B. A. course, but when shown the slender elective offered in B. A. courses, are unwilling to restrict their art study to the extent required. Professional study in art seems to them too long delayed if it must wait on academic graduation. The liberal electives now offered in the B. A. courses in mechanical arts, in agriculture, household economy, etc., should be extended in the same liberal spirit to the future artist.

In conclusion it was suggested that the B. A. course should offer adequate time and opportunity for instruction in drawing, painting, and design with art theory and history. These with the proper balance of English, foreign language, psychology and science would afford the future artist a B. A. graduation so desirable as a foundation for the artistic profession.

What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to:
The Future Museum Worker?

Discussion opened by JOSEPH BRECK, *Minneapolis Museum of Arts*
(Report of Committee on College Training for Museum Workers)

Mr. Breck's report is to be published in full in the American Magazine of Art.

Miss Edith R. Abbot of the Metropolitan Museum presented a report of her investigations on what is now being done by Colleges to prepare museum workers. Summary of this paper was printed in the May (1916) number of the Bulletin of the Metropolitan Museum.

Discussion by EDWARD ROBINSON, *Metropolitan Museum*.

No summary of Mr. Robinson's remarks has been received.

What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to:

The Future Writer on Art?

Discussion opened by MISS LEILA MECHLIN, *Secretary of the American Federation of Arts*.

In her paper on "What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to the Future Writer on Art" Miss Mechlin called attention first to the great need of competent writers on art, the scarcity of really good critics and the important mission to be performed by such.

"I am not very sure," she said, "that to train a writer on art any new or very different course should be introduced into the curriculum than those which should be provided for the average college student if he or she is to be really educated and fitted in the truest sense to take his or her place in society, to become a good citizen. This much and more, however, a college course can give: first, an historical setting; second, familiarity with the artists and their works, familiarity which is much more than a speaking acquaintance; and, third, knowledge of the best art criticism which has been written—little enough, we all know."

"There are two other things," she added, "which are very important to the training of the future writer on art, one a personal knowledge of the methods employed by artists, the mechanics of the trade, and a spiritual quality—sincerity. It is this quality, and the power to think, which the successful art writer must possess in addition to knowledge."

“For those who would enter this field the colleges can furnish equipment in the way of adequate background and well directed training. It is a large field, a real need, a great opportunity.”

Discussion by DUNCAN PHILLIPS, *of New York.*

Mr. Phillips' paper is to be published in full in the *American Magazine of Art.*

7 P. M.

Dinner at Hotel Normandie followed by a "Round Table" discussion on, What Instruction in Art Should the College A. B. Course Offer to the Future Layman?

Opened by HOMER E. KEYES, *Dartmouth*

Mr. Keyes held that the layman's need in matters artistic is, in the main, to be able to judge of the value of expert opinion, that this ability is dependent upon the cultivation of an understanding of certain underlying artistic principles or conceptions.

The study of the history of art as such does not necessarily intensify or cultivate artistic perceptions. These are, after all, best stimulated through training: first, in the abstract design, and, second, in the monumental expression of such design in the form of architecture.

Discussion by MISS EVA M. OAKES, *Oberlin.*

Courses in art which will be most useful to the future layman are those which will enable him to choose his belongings with taste. He should be taught to know what is good in pictures, through his own knowledge of the principles and processes of their making. A scientific knowledge of color harmony will help him to select with fitness instead of random choice.

The course of study given in Oberlin College consists in outline of lectures, assigned reading, and studio practice. The lectures convey the principles of the subject, the reading the inspiration of the artist, while the dynamic of self expression is furnished in the studio practice.

During the first semester the principles of proportion, linear and aerial perspective, and illumination are studied in theory and practice. Upon this is built a study of pictures such as illustrations, etchings, engravings.

The second semester covers the problems of color and composition. Experimental work is required in the possibilities of color, the harmony of contrasted colors, the harmonies of related colors. Each student plans a harmonious color scheme to be used in the home,—the plan including colors for walls, rugs, draperies, and furniture appropriate to each room. The theories of color harmony are also worked out as they relate to landscape painting.

The final examination requires the principles of the subject, the criticism of selected pictures, and the recognition of artists, through their work.

Discussion by MISS ELIZABETH H. DENIO, *Rochester.*

Miss Denio spoke of the advantage of living in a city like Rochester, N. Y., of the possibilities of helping individual students in the smaller college, and the constant stimulus for the teacher when the department is housed in an art gallery.

With the thought that art instruction may become too formal to stimulate students, that perhaps teachers need to change views and to seek fresh inspiration, Miss Denio urged the value of more personal observation on the part of the future layman, that he be left freer.

The American is said to have a visual type of mind, to take in easily ideas of form and color. The student, however, seems to belong to the auditory type, since seeing on his part is mixed up with knowing. To increase personal effort from students the following plan is proposed.

Illustrative material—photographs, prints, slides, original paintings—to be shown first; lectures and the use of the library to come later. As helps not to be despised Miss Denio would add drawing—exercises,

short talks each month in the gallery and print room, debates on suitable topics, and a weekly item of current art news.

A broader interpretation should be given to college art instruction which looks beyond the class room to society, high and low, adults and children, in an effort to bring art nearer to the people.

Discussion by H. H. POWERS, *President Bureau of University Travel.*

An Art Course for Laymen

The aim of such a course is appreciation, not production. There are but two possible methods: observation and practice—more popularly, art history and studio training. All agree that art history should have a place in a course for laymen. Is studio training also necessary? Its value is not called in question, but is it indispensable? Is it practicable under existing conditions?

We may dismiss the extreme contention that only artists can enjoy art, simply because it eliminates our problem. Art has no interest for the layman if he is in outer darkness. But Mr. Dow and other moderates plead for a special studio course for the layman, distinct from that for the practitioner, as an indispensable condition of his understanding art. Is this necessary? Is it practicable? Is it desirable?

Our colleges have limited means and personnel. Few employ more than a single teacher of art, still fewer more than two. Art history and vocational art training will and should come first. An appreciation studio course could be offered only by the vocational staff. Will they, can they, distinguish between the layman's and the practitioner's course? Not one college in twenty can offer two studio courses. Not one teacher in twenty will see any reason for doing so. The proposal, in practice, comes to this: Be an artist if you would know art.

This proposal is of too narrow application. It can be applied at most to painting, drawing, model-

ling, but not to building, mosaic, fresco and the like. If it is indispensable to appreciation, then architecture, mosaic, and fresco are beyond the pale. If it be effective at all, it destroys the balance between the arts, and favors the popular fallacy that painting is art.

But it narrows up painting as it narrows up art. The technique inculcated will be the modern technique. Will such an influence be fair to Bellini, to Velasquez, and to Monet? Will it not inevitably tend to destroy historic perspective and make the layman a partisan of the fad of the hour. I have just been talking with a strenuous partisan of this method, only to discover at the end that he was interested almost wholly in the neo-impressionists.

After all do we want the layman to be interested in *process*? Process is the means in art, never the end. The artist is all too prone to forget the end in his necessary interest in the means. The layman, representative of that public for whom the artist works, calls him back to his aim. He is restive and tries to persuade his mentor to forsake his viewpoint for his own. The change is bad for both. The artist needs the layman, needs to keep him a layman. To infatuate him with his own perilous interest in process is to destroy his function in the great art partnership. And after all the proof of the pudding is in the eating,—not in the cooking. We do not bring our guests to the banquet through the kitchen. The artist and the layman may be intelligent or the reverse, but their viewpoints are inherently complementary, never identical.

Discussion by GEORGE H. CHASE, *Harvard*.

It has seemed to me that the last speaker in a symposium such as this might use the time allotted to him to best advantage if he tried to sum up what had been said before, and as I have listened to the discussions of the past two days I have thought that it is possible to reconcile to some extent the different

points of view that have been expressed. Is it not possible that the solution of the problem of teaching the Fine Arts so as to serve the needs of several different classes of students lies in the establishment of two sorts of courses; one emphasizing the technical side of the work and including courses in drawing, painting, and the theory of design, the other emphasizing the history of the Fine Arts? Discussions of aesthetic principles and training in appreciation would naturally be attempted in both sorts of courses. Under such an arrangement, the future artist would be more interested in the technical course, and the future museum worker, lecturer on art, or layman, in the course which emphasizes the history of art. But neither should be allowed entirely to neglect any aspect of the subject. The future artist would, I think, be better trained if he knew something of the great achievements of the past, the others would certainly be better prepared to play their parts in the world if they had some technical training, and the great mass of our students who have an interest in art, but are quite undecided in regard to their future careers, would perhaps find help in making a decision.

This is the synthesis that has suggested itself to me as I have listened to the papers, and I offer it for what it may be worth. In any case, it seems to me that I see encouraging signs of agreement in the papers that have been read and the speeches that have been made at this meeting, signs that augur well for the future of our Association.

SATURDAY, APRIL 22, 9 A. M.

In Houston Hall

Problems in Art Education in Ohio

C. F. KELLEY, *Ohio*

Mr. Kelley's paper is to be published in full in the *American Magazine of Art*.

The College Art Museum and Art Gallery:

1. A Working College Museum of Originals

FRANK J. MATHER, *Princeton*

No abstract of Mr. Mather's paper has been received.

2. The College Museum of Reproductions

WILLIAM N. BATES, *University of Pennsylvania*

A museum of reproductions, which we may assume to be located in a town of moderate size and to have a moderate income for its maintenance, should contain, first, a few representative examples of the sculpture of Egypt and of Babylonia, both in the round and in relief, and of the frescoes and vases of Minoan Crete. Then there should be added casts of as many of the famous works of Greek sculpture as it is possible to procure. They should be selected in such a way as to illustrate the development of the different schools. The speaker gave a list of casts which in his opinion should not be omitted. Typical examples of Roman portraiture and work in relief should be included as well as casts of representative mediaeval monuments. Such a collection should be reinforced by a very full collection of photographs. The casts should always be of the same size as the original to prevent giving a false impression. There should be added also facsimiles of Greek coins, small bronzes of one kind or another, gems, terra-cottas, etc. Such a museum would be very useful in teaching the history of art and would stimulate an interest in art in the community in which it was located.

The College Museum of Reproductions.

DAVID M. ROBINSON, *Johns Hopkins*

For the teaching of art a museum is the tool of highest utility, as necessary as a laboratory to the teaching of chemistry. Originals are essential, but reproductions are also very important, especially as the originals are scattered. Although the student cannot learn aesthetics from them, he can learn much about composition, design, size, pose, history of art, etc.; and moreover reproductions give a sense of reality and correct false impressions. The paper con-

sidered various kinds of reproductions, photographs, squeezes, models, charts, etc.—but, above all, casts. An outline of Classical Art was given with an indication of the available reproductions. Mention was made of the excellent reproductions of Minoan and Mycenaean Art, especially of vases, statuettes, metal work, and the painted frescoes by Gillieron & Son, and by Saloustro. The galvanoplastic process, which reproduces by the help of exact moldings the original form as well as the brilliant color of the original metal, was described, and the long list of objects made by the Würtemberg metal factory was enumerated (Galvanoplastik, Geislingen-Steige, Würtemberg, Germany, or Gillieron & Son, Rue Skoupha 43, Athens), from Minoan and Mycenaean works of art to excellent copper-bronze reproductions of statues and busts not only from casts taken from originals, but from reconstructed works such as Myron's group of Athena and Marsyas, and to reproductions of the Hildesheim collection of silver ware and of Arretine vases. Colored reproductions and the bronzing of casts of Roman marble copies to resemble the bronze original were also described. Sometimes casts are of real scientific value. We often have casts where the originals are inaccessible or lost. So we can see in the Louvre a cast of the head of the Lancelotti discobolus, which itself cannot be seen. Also for purposes of reconstructing the original, casts are important. So to show what an original colossal statue by Phidias looked like, Amelung combined casts of the Medici torso, now in the Louvre and other works. Casts of works of architecture like those in the Metropolitan Museum are numerous. For Greek ivories, gems, and coins there are excellent reproductions; for example, the wonderful reproductions in the British Museum of the deposit of ivories, etc., found by Hogarth at Ephesus, the electrotype reproductions of coins made by the British Museum and such solder duplications of coins as Prof. Andrews of Cornell makes. Repro-

ductions of Greek vases are inferior, except the remarkable ones of Minoan vases like those of the beautiful stone vases found by Seager at Mochlos. Those of Salzger in Eisenach are inaccurate and of no scientific value. Of the bronzes in Naples there are fine reproductions by Sabatino De Angelis & Son or by Chiurazzi & Son, Naples. One of the most valuable collections of reproductions of Classical things in the United States is the Saalburg collection at the Washington University at St. Louis.

3. Loan Exhibits in College Art Museums

W. A. GRIFFITH, *Kansas*

(Report of Committee on Loan Exhibits)

No abstract of Mr. Griffith's paper has been received.

3. Loan Exhibits in College Art Museums

GEORGE B. ZUG, *Dartmouth*

For colleges situated at a distance from public art galleries occasional exhibitions are absolute necessities as supplementary to the regular courses. Only by having important exhibitions is it possible for the student to learn to appreciate the higher technical qualities of the arts and to apprehend the meaning of great painting, great sculpture or great etching. But whether the exhibitions are devoted to renaissance or modern art it is most important that, so far as possible, only the very best obtainable examples be shown.

As a means to this end I suggest the establishment and careful selection of exhibits for college circuits.

When I began organizing loan exhibitions for Dartmouth College I was so anxious to obtain original work that I almost felt content to show any work just so it was original, but both my judgment and experience lead me to make every effort to make more and more careful selection of what is to be shown. In the course of organizing several exhibitions of American painting and sculpture I have learned that the very ablest and most distinguished painters, sculp-

tors and etchers are only too glad to aid the cause of education by lending the best examples of their work. I refer not to the most noted artists, not to artists judged highly by commercial success but artists who are actually the best.

It is necessary not merely to obtain the cooperation of such painters and sculptors but to make sure that they be represented not by left-overs from their studios but by work of exceptional merit.

In conversation with certain artists I have learned to my surprise that they would especially welcome an opportunity to exhibit in a university and college circuit, and that the one thing necessary to insure adequate representation would be to give them plenty of time for preparation and selection. Certain artists have told me that in the case a college circuit was organized they would be only too glad to cooperate because of the importance of art education.

I mean to suggest that half a dozen colleges in the middle west might establish one circuit and half a dozen colleges or more in the east another circuit. Some local interest and therefore popularity among the undergraduates might be secured by obtaining loans from distinguished artists of the locality. I used this local interest successfully in holding an exhibition of artists associated with the colony of Cornish, New Hampshire. In that exhibition I was able to show the work of such first rate men as Augustus Saint-Gaudens, Charles A. Platt and John W. Alexander. The same thing could be done for other localities.

Sienese Art as Represented in the Fogg Art Museum

G. H. EDGELL, *Harvard*

Mr. Edgell's paper was published in full in *Art and Archaeology*, June 1916.